

## Economies of Sanctity

VALENTINA NAPOLITANO AND KRISTIN NORGET

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO AND MCGILL UNIVERSITY

v.napolitano@utoronto.ca; kristin.norget@mcgill.ca

Ought we really be rearranging everything all over again? Nothing is more harmful to the liturgy than a constant activism, even if it seems to be for the sake of genuine renewal.

(Ratzinger, 2000, 83)

### Introduction

This quotation from a book written by former Joseph Cardinal Ratzinger, now Pope Benedict XVI and Head of the Vatican State, reminds us of the divergent, tension-ridden impacts that the themes “activism” and “tradition” may have in the complex current transnational reproduction of the Roman Catholic Church in Latin America. With these themes sharply in focus, this collection of essays works toward a refinement of our methodological and theoretical anthropological tools for studying the Roman Catholic Church through a lens of “the political.”<sup>1</sup>

This special issue focuses on three principal axes of analysis. First, we argue for renewed attention to the changing scholarship on the anthropology of Catholicism, this within a broader anthropology of Christianity. Second, we wish to elaborate on the contribution these papers make to the ethnographic pluralities that have been created by the de facto, backlash revision of the reforms put in place by the Second Vatican Council (1962–1965). This revision was initiated by the politics of Pope John Paul

- 
1. This special issue based on specific ethnographic cases is of course partial to the totality of the complexity of a Roman Catholic Church and ‘Latin America’, while being a reflection on a research agenda that we hope will have resonance across the Americas. While scholarship exists that focuses on the Catholic Church’s explicit influence in global politics (e.g. Hanson 1987), our own configuration of the ‘political’ is much more expansive, and includes, following Foucault, the array of logics and practices that are imbricated in governmentality and the shaping of subjects.

II (head of the Church from 1978 to 2005), especially those surrounding charismatic renewal and Marian devotions, and has been continued by Benedict XVI's evident current preoccupation with the centrality of the liturgy and "religious truth." We argue, however, that despite the impact of these momentous developments on the global political status of the institutional Roman Catholic Church, little ethnographic research has dared to step out of customary analytical frames to offer a reflection on the broader cultural, social and political ramifications of changing forms of Roman Catholic Church governmentality, especially those of the last century. The current conjuncture of the revision of Second Vatican Council has multiple layers, hence we call for more anthropological studies that engage with this complexity as key to understanding the transformation of the Roman Catholic Church as a political subject.

This leads us to the third axis of analysis: the concept of governmentality. The current state of the revision of Second Vatican Council, we contend, demands to be studied in relation to a translocal reproduction of the Roman Catholic Church, as well as a study of the production of embattled new terrains of Catholic subject formation. The translocalism of the Roman Catholic Church becomes then for us a central tool for the study of the anthropology of Catholicism itself. In this regard, we find the term *translocalism* particularly apt and productive for two reasons: first, we want to move beyond the nation-state as the relevant unit of analysis in understanding local-global interactions, as is implied by the word "transnationalism." Following Matory (2005, 2), we stress how circuits of the flows of power, authority, and meaning involve Catholic communities within and across particular "locales" whose interconnection is not determined by considerations of the territorial jurisdictions of nation-state—and indeed often predates the latter's formation. Thus, as the papers in this collection show, the dialogues constituting the Roman Catholic Church's "religious regime" (Casanova 1997) are translocal, not transnational. That is, translocal Catholic flows of symbols, images, ideas, people, and power constitute trans-border communities structured by forces other than—but not outside of—the social, political and economic exigencies of bounded nation-states. Secular and sacred power are not mutually exclusive, but neither can their respective workings or guiding normative logics be reduced to one another. Hence localities and sites that seem socially, economically, and politically peripheral to the nation-state, such as the poor Zapotec communities in Oaxaca, Mexico, described by Norget, or even certain Church figures so strongly identified with such places, such as martyred El Salvadorean Bishop Oscar Romero (addressed

in Anna Peterson's and Manuel Vásquez's essay), may suddenly figure as central elements in Church global/translocal political machinations.

In addition, we underline the importance of translocalism as an institutional Church project of conjuring and inculcating in worshippers a deeply felt, embodied sense of belonging and allegiance to a larger, global Catholic community and project. As Coleman argued concerning Pentecostalist Christianity, essential for the easy spread of Pentecostalism is devotees' consciousness of forming part of an ever-widening circle (Coleman 2000) and of participating in a larger project of evangelism. Similarly, Norget and Peterson and Vásquez show in their articles that beatifications, canonizations, and other public performances have become especially important to the current *modus operandi* of the institutional Catholic Church in its concerted encouragement of such a translocal Catholic imaginary. Through such events, the Church affirms a transcendent symbolic and moral authority and global persona that is aimed at exerting a centralizing, cohering pull on dispersed and culturally diverse Catholic believers and communities the world over.

Finally, we want to stress the importance of understanding the reproduction of transnational and translocal Catholic religious regimes in terms of embodied, affective domains that are mediated by mimetic and mediatic presences (or absences), and that animate ongoing yet evolving spectacles of canonization, inculturation, and Catholic membership. All of the articles in this issue of *Postscripts* speak to these dimensions in different ways. Let us take up each of these points in turn.

An anthropology of Catholicism parallels but also diverges from an anthropology of Christianity. The latter has seen a recent blooming of intellectual and ethnographic debates around the work of scholars such as Birgit Meyer (1999), Webb Keane (2007), Joel Robbins (2004) and Matthew Engelke (2007). These scholars have opened central debates on, among other things, the power of mediation of Christianity, its semiotic ideologies, its cultural continuities within a *longue durée* paradigm of the discontinuity of conversion in Christianity, and the question of the presence of the divine with and through the presence of sacred texts. While we would not elect to align a genealogy of the anthropology of Catholicism in this same fashion, we would nonetheless underline that issues of mediation are absolutely central to understanding the politics of apparition and shrine devotions in contemporary Roman Catholicism (Norget, this volume; see also Apolito 2005; Orsi 2005, 1996, 1985; Vásquez and Marquardt 2000). Robert Orsi, for example, has rightly noted how British and North European religious scholarship has been characterized by an inherited

“anti-Catholic” bias which for a long time has sealed off the continuities between the present and Catholic Middle Ages (Orsi 2007, 39).<sup>2</sup> Working firmly against this bias are feminist and cultural historians’ “revitalization” of the medieval past in the present (Certeau 1984; Bynum 1987; Hollywood 2002; Fulton 2002), opening, among other things, important areas of research surrounding the symbolic and embodied physicality of body and blood as tenets of identity.

The roots of the anthropology of Catholicism are multiple, and a rethinking of the continuing vitality of medieval traces in various current Catholic communities is simply one of many promising avenues of investigation (Geisbusch 2009). For instance, in his study of nineteenth-century Catholic magic practices in Lucania (southern Italy), Ernesto de Martino argued that such practices were central to debunking dominant notions of modern rationality as the “basis of civilization” (Martino 2004, 129). *Il Cattolicesimo Meridionale* (Southern [European] Catholicism) for Martino provided an embodied arena of counter-hegemonic practices that challenged the dominant modern/rational model of bourgeois elites. It was in fact this particular Catholicism-of-the-south that could unsettle problematic reductive binaries of magic versus rationality. Importantly, such a religiosity would not fit within certain paradigmatic, “official” explanations of male/female genders as identified with public and private spheres, a binarism that had strongly colored understandings of the Mediterranean as a region both “fixed in time” and homogeneous.

A different, dynamic understanding of the interface between Roman Catholic structures and local practices has constituted a more productive analytical matrix of this imagined South. Through processes of adaptation and cooptation the locality of religion has been enlivened by a tension between written Catholic histories and the “messiness” of local oral and embodied reproductions tied to particular landscapes (Christian 1981, 179). Although, as Certeau warned us, this is a powerful scriptural economy, and it is precisely in the field of the translocal that this scriptural economy is both reproduced but also potentially subverted (Certeau 1984). Moreover, it is worth noting that Catholic southern Europe has been analyzed as a “creative involution,” a “progressive bricolage” of co-existing cosmologies (Cátedra 1992, 353), or a historical changing system of reciprocity between humans and saints that since the Second Vatican Council in the 1960s had seen a new emphasis on a generalized and idealized socially equal interiorization of the moral principles of Catholicism (Pina-Cabral 1986, 173).

2. Hence a lingering post-revolutionary Jacobinist attitude may go some way to explain the relative dearth of scholarship on the Catholic Church by Mexican scholars.

In a similar vein, works on the anthropology of Catholicism in Mesoamerica have stressed connections between religion, kinship, and personhood as cementing the internal structure and cohesion of rural (indigenous) communities. For example, ethnologists read Catholicism in rural 1950s and 1960s Mexico as being largely continuous with pre-conquest cosmology. Such a reading provided a frame for understanding gender relations with reference to the model of the triangular nuclear family (Mary, Joseph and the baby Jesus), and the celebration of life-cycle rituals that connected the development of personhood to key calendrical ritual celebrations of livelihood cycles (e.g., Ingham 1986; Nutini 1988). This paradigm also examined how personhood could be fragmented, “partible,” and reconstituted through Catholic rituals (Slaney 1997).

As in other parts of Latin America, the cult of saints, the ritual of the mass, and the presence of the life of Christ in the liturgy have also been seen as core characteristics specific to the Catholic practice. Analysis of pilgrimages and devotional cults of Christ in the Andes, for instance, showed that Catholic practice was the outcome of a historical continuity in pre- and post-conquest conflicts surrounding elite control of native and local sacred expressions (Sallnow 1982). Moreover, Catholicism in the Andes highlighted a tension during both the colonial and the independence periods between the intimate and the public spheres, and the existence of a tight interlocking of divine and devil narratives (Harris 2006). At the same time, anthropology has given attention to capitalist transformations and their impacts on indigenous labor, which have produced indigenous negotiation, narratives, and embodied practices around the figure of the devil in response to forces of unequal market accumulation (Taussig 1980; Nash 1979).

Thus, Catholic practices across the Americas have always been hybridized, at times with local and native forms of spirit possession and gendered local re-telling of “national” histories (Behar 1993). An exploration of an anthropology of Catholicism undertaken along binary gendered lines may be insufficient for understanding the complexity of ethical personhood and the cultivation of the “good subject” that is at stake in local practices of Catholicism (Mayblin 2010). We would insist on taking this point seriously, and further argue that for some of these articles, and for an anthropology of Catholicism in general, the issue of ethical orientation is absolutely central. Ethical orientations are the engine of multiple lifeworld(s) and their continual reconstitution in ultimate moments of suffering or in facing death (Pandolfo 2007). But they are also the subtle forms for the reproduction of regimes of governmentality.

There is of course a strict connection between the historical forms of Roman Catholic pastoral power, its logic of power based on a confessional mode, its fostering of individual “inner” depth, and the emergence of modern forms of technologies of governmentality. Rather than pursuing a more classic reading of Foucault, which might see Christian and Catholic modalities of power as cradles of power for modern states, we are interested to dwell on the question of the changing nature of governmentality *within* the Roman Catholic Church. Foucault rightly queries the nature of the margins, the pastoral organization of the Church and the process of borrowing, adjusting, and mimesis that actually animate pastoral power:

Generally speaking these themes [eschatology, Scripture, mysticism, community, asceticism] that have been fundamental elements in these counter-conducts are clearly not absolutely external to Christianity, but are actually border-elements, if you like, which have been continuously re-utilized, re-implanted, and taken up again in one or another direction and these elements, such as mysticism, eschatology, [or] the search of community, for example, have been continually taken up by the Church itself. (Foucault 2004, 215)

So it is the borrowing, reuse, and mimetic encounters of “border-elements” (see the place of “mystical” impulses in different religious orders and in lay religious movements such as the charismatic ones) that for us illuminate changing forms of Roman Catholic governmentality.

Economies of sanctities are indeed forms of governmentality produced within the Roman Catholic Church through processes of recirculation, mimesis and relocalization. The translocal examples we explore in this special issue show a salient tension between sanctification and martyrdom. The fetishization and multiplication of beatifications occurring since the papacy of John Paul II have converged with often successful attempts to depoliticize grassroots devotions and push them toward domestication and a privatization of the cult of sanctity. Peterson and Vásquez put it well in their discussion of Romero’s case: “the people’s saint must become ‘a martyr of the church’” first. Peterson’s and Vásquez’s contribution highlights a major shift in governmentality of the Roman Catholic Church in regard to the matter of canonization. A shift has taken place in the official Vatican politics of sainthood, one seeing a turn from an emphasis on canonical law in the ratification of someone’s eligibility for beatification (the first step toward sainthood), toward a stronger weighting of historical and theological signs as vectors for canonizations that are eventually realized or else (significantly) withheld.

Another central aspect of the Roman Catholic Church’s governmentality has been mimesis. Mimesis and mimetic faculties are, in Walter

Benjamin's reading (1999), those historical and material processes, especially mediated and ruptured by language, that have an intrinsic power of subject and social transformation. This potential for open-ended as well as disruptive transformations is indeed rooted in particular forms of bioreligiosity and materiality, and the relics Norget discusses in the case of the Oaxacan Martyrs of Cajonos signal this unsettling potentiality.

We can see mimesis working in other cases we examine as well. Mimetic *imitatio Christi* runs through present-day Legionaries of Christ's cultivation of the self/subject (Napolitano, this issue) and infuses the re-imagining of Archbishop Romero's strength (Peterson and Vásquez, this issue). We are here engaging with different forms of mimesis and mimetic encounters that have alternative and contradictory political significances. O'Neill stresses that in Guatemala the imitation of Christ's suffering engenders "translocal teleologies [that] far too often overlook the present for the sake of the future," with the effect that temporalities based on a notion of deferred achievement obscure the urgency of the current suffering and violence of Guatemalan people.

In a different light, Giménez Béliveau explores how this same mimesis among the Roman Catholic traditional groups of the Fraternity of St Thomas Aquinas (FASTA) and the Institute of the Incarnate Word (IVE) in Argentina manifests itself as a heroic model of missionization in the global world. In this instance, the mimesis with Christ is about a sacrifice to take up that journey to "convert the stranger," a journey imagined as a path toward near-divinity. Gimenez Béliveau shows that a specific translocal Catholicism within a larger Catholic reservoir is actually enlivened via both the formation of militant fictive and blood kinship and the constant reiteration of obedient subjectivization to a sacrificial glory of God. Not a bad utopia for new Catholic orthodoxy in a post-dictatorship Argentina. But sacrifice and suffering in the imitation of the life of Christ are not the only mimetic possibilities for renewed forms of Catholic governmentality. Peterson and Vásquez show instead how in the case of Monsignor Romero there is a mimesis that does not exactly embrace Jesus's crucifixion, but rather points to an alternative affective domain that mirrors the capacity of Christ to be with the people and make himself a pilgrim in their life journey. As Peterson and Vásquez explain, this is by far the principal narrative that the conservative sector of the Salvadoran Catholic oligarchy is interested to embrace. Once again plural tensions haunt the significations of mimetic encounters and sanctity within the Catholic Church, and surfeits of religious signification haunt the neat closure of Roman Catholic governmentality (Napolitano 2009).

Nevertheless, Roman Catholic Church governmentality is also shaped by the disposition and control of the formation of bodies, and the trans-locality of the Church is very much entangled with the remembering, dismembering and even the excess of body parts. The working of the Roman Catholic Church as a “passionate machine” rests on the “psychic glue of histories” and the affective force that those histories entail (Napolitano, this issue). Those forces are embedded in particular bodies, histories and places. They make this embeddedness a key element for understanding how a translocal Roman Catholic Church both inspires the privatization of piety at the same time as the glorification of key figures and personages who can be enlisted for “a global Church renewal.” Here the case of the indigenous Martyrs of Cajonos described by Norget shows how the Church’s self-affirmation as a unified global faith community in today’s world, a world in which the numerical force of Catholicism is no longer centered in Western Europe, depends partly on the imperative of managing the potentially fragmenting particularities of local, peripheral Catholicisms. Although the Vatican is no longer the demographic metropole of Catholic faith, it remains its political heart. While considered deeply problematic by Ratzinger and other conservative theologians, Indigenous Theology, a Church movement that grew out of liberation theology and which called for a marrying of Catholic and indigenous religiosities, exemplified progressives’ efforts truly to embrace The Other on equal terms. Yet even this movement can be seen as an effort by Church representatives to preserve the Church’s authority and coherence through a model of culture that sees the core Catholic message (“the seed of the word”) as a latent, timeless and omnipresent entity, and indigenous culture (including religiosity), like those who “bear” it, as both perpetually vulnerable and somehow intrinsically deficient (Norget 2010).

But the embeddedness and the embodiment of a translocal Roman Catholic Church also renews forms of conflict and violence. O’Neill, for example, in the case of post-civil war Guatemala asks how a modern teleology of progress, future growth, and good/productive Catholic citizens is tinged at the edges with an excess of blood. Blood in the margin of intimidating gang letters left for public gazing, together with body parts that are regularly found on Guatemala City streets, can no longer afford a fantasy of a Catholic resurrection of the integral body. Body parts here become more the index for an uncanny medieval breakdown of the “physical coherence” of the body, and the spillage of blood reminds us of the limit of human agency in producing the past, present and future (Bildhauer 2006).



The connection between medieval returns, blood spillages, and blood as forging ties (such as those of kinship) is an important arena to understand the destructive/constructive force of the new vitalism of Roman Catholicism in contemporary Latin America. More anthropological research along these promising avenues of investigation is sorely needed. Giménez Béliveau's article already shows us how marriage and ties of blood among missionary members of FASTA and IVE are central to understanding the reproduction of religious conservative orthodoxy and the imaginations of a post-secular society and sociality that stand both above and paradoxically within the nation-state. Such consanguineal ties and the journey of missionization sanctify global Catholic citizenship over and above a project of the nation-state although in uncannily partial continuities with post-military dictatorships. Yet in his article, O'Neill warns us of the danger of the violent interstices of the nation-state (rather than its spatial transcendence) where masquerades of modern and progressive teleologies obscure a de facto dismembering of bodies, excesses of violence and body parts.

It is the idea of a global Catholic citizenship that translocally revives the forceful and pervasive theme of *Militia*. The robust image of the Militia Christi—a global lay movement that celebrates a zealous, chivalric commitment to Christian devotion—strengthens the centrality of the orthodoxy but also paradoxically erodes the hegemony of the centrality of institutional Catholic Church power. In fact, new forms of communal sociality among traditional Roman Catholic groups in Argentina speak to the perceived “failure” of the Catholic Church to be traditional *enough* and of the need to promote a notion of global Catholic citizenship that is stronger than that offered by the nation-state. The Legionaries of Christ demonstrate an orthodoxy that is married to an attempt to “colonize” the interstices of the (Mexican and Italian) states—in other words, the spaces within the state that can secure the organization's properly (Catholic) reproduction. That allows us to think of potential avenues of analysis away from the classic distinction of private piety and public devotion (or perhaps in Benedict XVI's terms, relativism and dogmatism) and instead toward the proliferation of Catholic practices that produce different ethical horizons and ethical investments. Hence these ethical horizons situate what O'Neill (echoing Levinas) refers to as the possibility of “allow[ing] the knowledge of the Other to mark me” as being central to an engaged anthropological research on Roman Catholicism.

The proliferation of Catholicism at the margins or at the interstices of the nation-state in Latin America, however, is seen not only in the

invigoration of new orthodox movements or the return to a time of a resurrection of a recomposed body. For local Catholicisms are also counter-hegemonic spaces: the *Pastoral Indígena* and expressions of inculturation, for example, cannot be easily domesticated as simply “local” devotions. MacKenzie’s article speaks to this complexity and to the unmistakably political status of the Roman Catholic Church in Latin America. The two priests he presents in his essay demonstrate that the tension between structure and process may not be the best avenue to study the matrix of the political—in its sense as forms of social action and its fantasies. MacKenzie here suggests the promise of critical thinking along the model of Castells’ notions of network and circulation of power (Castells 1996) that makes the *Pastoral Indígena* still a thorn in the side of the Church, not only because of its capacity for grassroots mobilization, but also for the theological challenges it poses to Roman Catholic *doxa*.

At this juncture we would like to return to the second point mentioned at the beginning of this introduction regarding the ethnographic pluralities generated by post-Vatican II reforms. The Second Vatican Council initiated by John XXIII marked, in the words of renowned theologian Hans Küng, “an epoch-making and irrevocable turning point” (Küng 2003, 182) in the Church’s external and internal personae. The Roman, centrist underpinnings of the Church’s worldview were replaced by a new imperative of renewal and a revised social contract with the diversity of Catholic communities around the world in all their cultural complexities. Ecumenism combined with an emphasis on the freedom of religion and conscience and on human rights. This was a resolutely modern Church, born from the ashes of the medieval, counter-Reformation anti-modernist outlooks that had caused the Roman Catholic Church to appear irrelevant and incapable of responding to the realities of contemporary world society. Post-Vatican II reforms instated a new centripetal dynamic in theology and praxis as these were adapted to local and national conditions, partly through a new emphasis given to local churches and national conferences of bishops.

It was Medellín-inspired Latin American liberation theology that pushed Vatican II’s de-centralizing and relativizing thrust even further. The Progressivists’ Church of the Poor eroded the “proper” boundary between secular and sacred spheres, encouraging the insertion of clergy into the struggles and suffering of their communities, especially the impoverished and marginalized, including indigenous populations. A new paradigm of Church was born, one that implicitly relocated the moral and authentic heart of Catholicism from the institution to the people and their

historical, everyday struggles against the official forces of oppression. Yet as Norget's essay points out, a closer consideration of concepts of inculturation and indigenous theology forces an awareness of the perceived risks of relativizing movements for the Church as localization may threaten the stability of its authority and, indirectly, the Pope's universal jurisdiction and the unity of the Church as an inviolable body. MacKenzie's article also throws into relief the role of priests as potential innovators, local "prophets" who, even from the edges of political power, may meaningfully push the bounds of church doctrine and teachings in new ways, again implicitly troubling the coherent, constant Church body. We also see how "progressivism" as innovation can point in the direction of either an erosion of established ecclesial and secular hierarchies or (in ways that may not be not readily apparent) the buttressing of a given political order. Thus apostolic lay organizations such as the Legion of Mary or Militia Christi, or Church movements like the Legionaries of Christ examined by Napolitano (with its own lay wing *Regnum Christi*), are dynamic, translocal associations that have distinct devotional agendas while they uphold fundamental ideals of traditional, Vatican-sanctioned Catholicism. And new movements such as the Catholic Charismatic Renewal may be seen, as MacKenzie does, as heterodox. But through the Charismatics' emphasis on ecstatic forms of worship (for example, touch healing, or the centrality of music and performativity), on youth and female leadership, it may also be read as an attempt by the Church at appropriating the sensuous appeal of Pentecostalist Christianity and affirming traditional ideals of apoliticism and institutional Church authority.

Such ambivalence and contradiction form perhaps the key features of the institutional Roman Catholic Church's praxis today. Benedict XVI has famously maligned relativism's repudiation of objective truth (and especially of moral truths) as the central crisis facing both the Roman Catholic Church—and indeed the world—in the twenty-first century. Yet despite his fiercely protective stance and insistence on Church unity, under his leadership (following the legacy of his predecessor John Paul II), the Church has developed new ways to acknowledge and even privilege cultural particularities and to hem in the subversive potential of heterodoxy by changing its ontology to one of difference-in-sameness, subsumed in "unity."

Like other economies, economies of sanctity are maintained through mechanisms of regulatory control. An increasingly visible means by which the Church exerts its disciplinary control is through a "spectacularization" (Debord 1967) of certain Church events (for example, the Pope's

international tours, canonizations, and Catholic World Youth Days). In the last decade especially, the Church has attempted in Latin America to reinforce many of these strategies through coverage and promotion of events and activities on the Internet, television, film, video, radio, and in other media forms (e.g., websites, newspaper advertisements, posters, billboards, and comic books). The nature of the spread of Catholicism has been irrevocably transformed by such changes in the religious “mediascape” (Appadurai 1990)—the images of the sacred and of the world created by mediatic forms, and their potentially transnational and translocal flows. A new interest in media in the formation of religious subjects in Latin America is steadily developing (for example, see Csordas 2009; Abreu 2002), yet more research is needed on the role of media in the cultivation of dispositions and subjectivities and thus new (embodied) senses of belonging to a larger community.

Finally we understand that an anthropological focus on the translocality of economies of sanctity in the Roman Catholic Church is part of a wider shift in and interrogation of the study of ethnographies of power. Ethnographies of global assemblages are now interested to trace the translocal actor-networks that collectively “assemble” such knowledge (Ong and Collier 2005; Latour 2005; Strathern 1996). Hubs of “passionate” religious knowledge are differently distributed across places through networks of actors, movements, and commodities (seen, for example, in the increasing importance of markets of relics and Catholic religious tourism). In this sense these global assemblages of Catholic practices and materiality create new chains of desire that also destabilize a sedimented paradigm of Church versus (“secular”) nation-state as container (or negation) of cultural Catholic identity. Following the traces of these renewed or newly imagined translocalities invites, or better impels us to dwell on a paradoxical space: one which is open to negotiation and unpredictable connections and at the same time to stronger than ever forms of categorical truth and orthodoxy.

### References

- Abreu, Maria José Alves de. 2002. “On Charisma, Meditation and Broken Screens.” *Etnofoor* 15(1): 240–258.
- Apolito, Paolo. 2005. *The Internet and the Madonna: Religious Visionary Experience on the Web*. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press.
- Appadurai, Arjun. 1990. *Modernity at Large: Cultural Dimensions of Globalization*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.
- Behar, Ruth. 1993. *Translated Woman: Crossing the Border with Esperanza’s Story*. Boston, MA: Beacon Press.

- Benjamin, Walter. 1999 [1936]. "The Work of Art in the Age of Mechanical Reproduction." In *Illuminations*, edited by Hannah Arendt; translated by Harry Zor. London: Pimlico.
- Bildhauer, Bettina. 2006. *Medieval Blood*. Cardiff: University of Wales Press.
- Bynum, Caroline Walker. 1987. *Holy Feast and Holy Fast: The Religious Significance of Food to Medieval Women*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Casanova, José. 1997. "Globalizing Catholicism and the Return to a 'Universal' Church." In *Transnational Religion and Fading States*, edited by Suzanne Hoeber Rudolph and James Piscatori, 121–143. Boulder: Westview Press.
- Castells, Manuel. 1996. *The Rise of the Network Society, The Information Age: Economy, Society, and Culture, Vol. 1*. Cambridge: Blackwell.
- Cátedra Tomás, María. 1992. *This World, Other Worlds: Sickness, Suicide, Death, and the Afterlife among the Vaqueiros de Alzada of Spain* [Muerte y otros mundos]. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press.
- Certeau, Michel de. 1984. *The Practice of Everyday Life*. Translated by Steven Rendall. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Christian, William. 1981. *Local Religion in Sixteenth-Century Spain*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Coleman, Simon. 2000. *The Globalisation of Charismatic Christianity: Spreading the Gospel of Prosperity*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1017/CBO9780511488221>
- Csordas, Thomas. 2009. "Global Religion and the Reenchantment of the World: The Case of the Charismatic Catholic Renewal." In *Transnational Transcendence*, edited by T. Csordas, 73–95. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Debord, Guy. 1967. *The Society of the Spectacle*. Translated by Donald Nicholson-Smith. New York: Zone Books. Reprint edition, 1994.
- Engelke, Matthew Eric. 2007. *A Problem of Presence: Beyond Scripture in an African Church*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Foucault, Michel. 2004. *Security, Territory, Population: Lectures at the College of France, 1977–1978*. Edited by Michel Sennellart; translated by Graham Burchell. New York: Picador.
- Fulton, Rachel. 2002. *From Judgment to Passion: Devotion to Christ and the Virgin Mary, 800–1200*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Geisbusch, Jan W. 2009. *Awkward Objects: Relics, the Making of Religious Meaning, and the Limits of Control in the Information Age*. PhD Thesis, Department of Anthropology, University College London.
- Hanson, Eric O. 1987. *The Catholic Church in World Politics*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Harris, Olivia. 2006. "The Eternal Return of Conversion: Popular Christianity in Highland Bolivia." In *The Anthropology of Christianity*, edited by Fenella Cannell, 51–76. Durham, NC: Duke University Press.
- Hollywood, Amy M. 2002. *Sensible Ecstasy: Mysticism, Sexual Difference, and the Demands of History*. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press.
- Ingham, John M. 1986. *Mary, Michael, and Lucifer: Folk Catholicism in Central Mexico*. Austin: University of Texas Press.
- Keane, Webb. 2007. *Christian Moderns: Freedom and Fetish in the Mission Encounter*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Küng, Hans. 2003. *The Catholic Church: A Short History*. Translated by John Bowden. New York: Random House.

- Latour, Bruno. 2005. *Reassembling the Social, and introduction to Actor-Network Theory*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Martino, Ernesto de. 2004 [1959]. *Sud e magia*. Edited by Umberto Galimberti. Milano: Feltrinelli.
- Matory, James Lorand. 2005. *Black Atlantic Religion: Tradition, Transnationalism, and Patriarchy in the Afro-Brazilian Candomblé*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Mayblin, Maya. 2010. *Gender, Catholicism, and Morality in Brazil: Virtuous Husbands, Powerful Wives*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1057/9780230106239>
- Meyer, Birgit. 1999. *Translating the Devil: Religion and Modernity Among the Ewe in Ghana*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.
- Napolitano, Valentina. 2009. "The Virgin of Guadalupe: A Nexus of Affect." *Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute* 15.1(March): 96–112.
- Nash, June C. 1979. *We Eat the Mines and the Mines Eat Us: Dependency and Exploitation in Bolivian Tin Mines*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Norget, Kristin. 2010. "A Cacophony of Autochthony: Representing Indigeneity in Oaxacan Popular Mobilization." *Journal of Latin American and Caribbean Anthropology* 15(1): 116–43.
- Nutini, Hugo. 1988. *Todos Santos in Rural Tlaxcala: A Syncretic, Expressive, and Symbolic Analysis of the Cult of the Dead*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Ong, Aihwa and Stephen Collier, eds. 2005. *Global Assemblages: Technology, Politics and Ethics*. New York: Blackwell.
- Orsi, Robert A. 1985. *The Madonna of 115th Street: Faith and Community in Italian Harlem, 1880–1950*. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press.
- . 1996. *Thank You, St. Jude: Women's Devotion to the Patron Saint of Hopeless Causes*. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press.
- . 2005. *Between Heaven and Earth: The Religious Worlds People Make and the Scholars Who Study Them*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- . 2007. "When 2+2=5." *American Scholar* 76(2): 34–43.
- Pandolfo, Stefania. 2007. "The Burning: Finitude and the Political-Theological Imagination of Illegal Migration." *Anthropological Theory* 7(3): 329–363. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1177/1463499607080194>
- Pina-Cabral, João de. 1986. *Sons of Adam, Daughters of Eve: The Peasant Worldview of the Alto Minho*. Oxford: Clarendon Press.
- Ratzinger, Joseph Cardinal. 2000. *The Spirit of the Liturgy*. Translated by John Saward. San Francisco, CA: Ignatius Press.
- Robbins, Joel. 2004. *Becoming Sinners: Christianity and Moral Torment in a Papua New Guinea Society*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Sallnow, M. J. 1982. "A Trinity of Christs: Cultic Processes in Andean Catholicism." *American Ethnologist* 9: 730–749. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1525/ae.1982.9.4.02a00070>
- Slaney, Frances M. 1997. "Double Baptism: Personhood and Ethnicity in the Sierra Tarahumara of Mexico." *American Ethnologist* 24: 279–301. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1525/ae.1997.24.2.279>
- Strathern, Marilyn. 1996. "Cutting the Network." *Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute* 2: 517–535.
- Taussig, Michael T. 1980. *The Devil and Commodity Fetishism in South America*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press.
- Vásquez, Manuel A., and Marie F. Marquardt. 2000. "Globalizing the Rainbow Madonna: Old Time Religion in the Present Age." *Theory, Culture & Society* 17(4): 119–143.