

to strengthening the adaptive capacity of those more vulnerable to climate change.

Reference

Ensor, J. and Berger, R. 2009: *Conclusion: Community-based adaptation in practice* in *Understanding climate change adaptation: Lessons from community-based approaches*. Practical Action Publishing, Rugby, chapter 10.

Chris Donaldson
School of International Development
University of East Anglia
Norwich, UK

Murray Li, Tania. 2014: *Land's End: Capitalist Relations on an Indigenous Frontier*. Durham and London: Duke University Press. 225 pp. £55.00 (cloth), £15.99 (paper). ISBN 978-0-8223-5694-3 (library cloth edition), 978-0-8223-5705-6 (paper).

10.1177/1464993415608455

Tania Murray Li's book *Land's End: Capitalist Relations on an Indigenous Frontier* is a detailed account of the emergence of capitalist relations among the highlanders in the Lauje area in Indonesia. Through ethnographic research spread over almost 20 years (1990–2009), Li is able to closely trace the factors that have transformed the economic and social relations in the region. Her elaborate analysis substantiates the main argument, which posits that the emergence of capitalist relations based on competition and profit does not necessarily require a forceful intervention from the state or big transnational corporations but can involve a mundane and stealthy process arising through the conjuncture of certain social, economic and political factors.

In the book, Li adopts an 'analytic of conjuncture' that takes account of the various economic, social and institutional elements that contribute to this process. The work of Marxist theorists such as Bernstein, Brenner or Wood is used to build the basis to conceptualize 'capitalist relations'. Li also follows the Marxist method as she incorporates the historical and

political shaping of the conjuncture. The book demonstrates the strength of the ethnographic method to explore complex developments and the diversity of life experiences but also provides insights that transcend the local context. Every argument is underpinned by the story of one or more persons, which takes the reader into the highlands of Indonesia.

Li begins her empirical account with an in-depth analysis of the processes that shaped the formation of identities and social and economic relations in the two centuries leading up to 1990. Among the highlanders, Li identifies religious as well as geographic lines of division. The extractive relations between the highlanders and the people in the coastal region were shaped by a discourse that depicted the highlanders as backward as well as by trading goods. The coastal merchants made profit out of the goods provided by the highlanders. What drove highlanders into these relations was not only coercion but also attraction of the market and the available goods.

The author analyzes the relations of work and care among the highlanders (pp. 58–83), which she compares against idealistic perceptions of indigenous societies. Individual efforts of work built the basis for property ownership and thereby for the economic autonomy of each household member.

Li explains in detail the process of enclosure that represented a fundamental change in highlander society (pp. 84–114). In contrast to other studies, Li shows that it was not big transnational corporations grabbing the land or the government enclosing it through legislation. Rather, it happened piecemeal through the interplay of several factors. The plantation of cacao trees was one major turning point because the previously common land passed into private ownership. This was due to the permanence inherent to the plantation of tree crops. For the first time 'land' became a unit of space that was owned by an individual and could be sold and bought. The book makes clear that this development was not seen as a sharp break but was more

or less accepted by the people due to prevailing values and discourses. Working on the land created legitimate property rights. Who was gaining and who was losing out was decided by social standing, power, money and clout. The planting of cacao itself was motivated by the hope of improving material conditions through the profits that would be made. *Land's End* displays the complexity of enclosure and the social processes associated with it, which were based not only on threats and coercion but also on the desire for a better life.

In chapter 4 (pp. 115–49), Li sheds light on the rising inequality among the highlanders. The lack of access to land for some was due to the accumulation of land by others. Under these circumstances not only did land become commoditized but also labour. For the emergence of capitalist relations driven by profit and competition another factor was crucial: the compulsion to actually sell land and the labour. Li observes that this was due to the simultaneous 'erosion of non-commoditized relations', which had previously allowed people to 'access food, labor, land, and help to weather crises' (p. 116).

When looking at the mechanisms that catered for the success of certain individuals, Li finds that the Lenin's (1899) propositions still hold: 'technical efficiency in production, determined by access to capital or credit to acquire the necessary inputs; economies of scale; usury/money lending; and extraction of surplus value from workers' (pp. 127–28). With acuity, Li shows how these mechanisms – combined with other elements such as the nature of the crops, aspirations and habits, crop prices and droughts – formed the specific conjuncture that allowed capitalist relations to establish. What is missing, however, is a closer analysis of the national and international political and economic context in which these developments occurred. This is only touched upon in the final chapter when explaining the lack of protest by the highlanders.

Despite the graveness of these developments, almost no protests could be observed

in the Lauje area. Li explains this, by the highlanders' not being opposed to the practices which individuals applied to obtain the land. Moreover, the class division had just emerged and ties of kinship still remained. The observation of non-revolt triggers Li's critique of practices of social movements, which mostly direct their agendas to oppressed communities engaged in active struggles. The Lauje highlanders do not fit into that picture and their suffering thereby failed to be recognized. Li explores out-migration and the search for alternative employments as alternative options. However, she unravels their limitation due to the dearth of jobs in the surroundings, the highlanders' lack of education and language skills as well as their relative isolation.

Land's End challenges hitherto existing ideas about the emergence of capitalist relations and life experiences at the indigenous frontier. This makes the book highly attractive for students and scholars interested in capitalist development and agrarian change. Li explicitly addresses social movements and policy makers who she thinks would be well advised to account carefully for the complex realities with which they interfere.

Reference

Lenin, Vladimir Illich 1964/1899: *The development of capitalism in Russia*. Moscow: Progress Publishers.

Elena Hofferberth
Independent Researcher
London, UK

Reid, M. 2014: *Brazil: The Troubled Rise of a Global Power*. New Haven and London: Yale University Press. 336 pp. £20.00 cloth. ISBN: 9780300165609.

10.1177/1464993415608456

This book offers a broad introduction to Brazil from a social, political, economic and historical perspective. Punctuating each chapter is a political and economic policy analysis of